Volume 10, No. 1, June 2014

Window with a view:
Perspectives in music education

Editor: Roger Buckton

Contents and Abstracts
(The full issue may be accessed by clicking HERE, or on the cover image below)
Contents

*e-Journal of Studies in Music Education* .................................................. 4

About MERC ................................................................. 4

The editorial team of the e-journal .................................................. 5

The refereeing procedure .......................................................... 8

Editorial ................................................................. 10

Articles

*Window with a View: Reflections on Sistema Aotearoa*

Robyn Trinick .......................... 11

*Creating a Space and Place for Culture Bearers Within Tertiary Institutions: Experiencing East African Dance Songs in South Africa*

Dawn Joseph .......................... 12

*From Air to Ear – the Beginnings of Music Broadcasts to Schools in New Zealand*

David Sell .......................... 13

*Froebel’s Gifts to Early Childhood Music Education*

Jane Southcott .......................... 14

*The Parental Voice in Primary School Education Policy: Do the Arts have a Place?*

Rowena Riek .......................... 15

*Index of Sound Ideas 1997 to 2009* .................................................. 16

The *e-Journal of Studies in Music Education*

In academic publishing, change is as inevitable as in every other field of communication. The *e-journal of studies in music education*, is the third generation of University of Canterbury publications on music education, having yielded to the pressures of the electronic medium, and in the process, taken on a change of name.

The publications date from 1986, when the School of Music began publishing the Canterbury Series of *Studies in Music Education*. This went through six issues under the general editorship of David Sell before a regenerated enthusiasm, led by Roger Buckton newly appointed Head of the School of Music, brought changes of format as well as of name. *Sound Ideas* was a journal of general music educational interest that enjoyed a life of eleven years and nineteen issues.

From 2009, a number changes were made. The first and most important was that it should become a fully refereed journal devoted to substantial research articles of particular relevance to New Zealand and Australian music educators. To distinguish this, a change of name seemed appropriate. This led to the decision to publish it as an electronic journal. At the same time, responsibility for its production was passed to the National Centre for Research in Music Education (MERC), which continues to be based in the School of Music at the University of Canterbury.

Also in 2009 the relationship with the Australian and New Zealand Association for Research in Music Education (ANZARME) was strengthened with the joint conference of ANZARME and MERC in Akaroa, and a stronger New Zealand involvement in trans-Tasman music education research interests. One consequence of this was the decision by ANZARME to recognise the *e-journal of studies in music education* as its recommended e-journal.

From this issue the *Contents and Abstracts* will be freely on line, with a small charge being made to download the full issue or articles from it. A subscription procedure has been set up to give individuals and libraries full access.

**About MERC**

Since 2006 the National Centre for Research in Music Education and Sound Arts (MERC) has served as the national hub for the coordination of and contribution to research in music education and sound arts in New Zealand. It aims to increase understanding and knowledge of the musical arts in education and in the wider community. MERC is devoted to developing the national and international profile of music education in Aotearoa New Zealand.

One of twenty five research centres at the University of Canterbury, MERC works in the College of Arts under the general management of the School of Music.

Te Puna Puoru National Centre for Research in Music Education and Sound Arts

Music Education Research Centre (MERC)
School of Music, College of Arts
Tel: +64 3 364 7132, Email: merc@canterbury.ac.nz, www.merc.canterbury.ac.nz
Roger Buckton is an associate-professor at the School of Music, University of Canterbury. His career encompasses secondary school teaching, the advisory service and preservice teacher education. From 1990/92 he was the director of the team that wrote the Ministry of Education's three Teacher Handbooks in Music Education. Other publications include *Sing a Song of Six Year Olds (NZCER)*, and the MUSIKit Recorder Series.

In the past few years, his research interests have focused on the music of the New Zealand Bohemians – an ethnic group that settled in Puhoi, North Auckland in 1863. This has lead to numerous performances of the music in New Zealand and overseas. This year, his group “Folkworks” performs in the Chodsko Folk Festival, Czech Republic 8 – 10 August and a few days before, his book, *Bohemian Journey*, published in 2013 by Steele Roberts, Wellington will receive its European launch in Stodt, the place where the first pioneers caught the train for their long journey to the other side of the world. *Bohemian Journey* traces the cultural heritage of the Bohemians amidst a dominant British culture which was itself coming to terms with pioneering life.
Following twelve years as a music specialist in secondary schools in the Wellington region, David Sell was District Music Adviser in Canterbury, a position that he held for two years before being appointed lecturer in music at the University of Canterbury. In his twenty-eight years on the full-time staff he rose to reader/associate professor, served two terms as Dean of Music and Fine Arts and was eight years Head of the School of Music. Since retiring, he continued for some years as a part-time lecturer, specializing in music education. He is currently an Adjunct Associate Professor at the School of Music.

David was for eighteen years on the Board of the New Zealand Society for Music Education (now MENZA), is Deputy-President of ANZARME, was inaugural president, and is a current committee member of Music Education Canterbury, was on the setting up committee and Board of Studies of the National Academy of Singing and Dramatic Art (NASDA), President of the Specialist Music Programme for its first six years, and is currently Chairman of Arts Canterbury.

The author, co-author or editor of thirty-nine books, mostly concerning music education, he is also a concert reviewer for The Press, Christchurch, and has written at various times for the New Zealand Listener, Opera, Opera, and publications of the International Society for Music Education. He participated in five ISME conferences, in Tunis, London (Ont.), Canberra, Helsinki and Seoul, and at ISME Research Commission seminars in Gummersbach, Christchurch and Mexico City, and seminars of the Commission for Music in Schools and Teacher Training in Leningrad and Kyong-ju.
Patrick Shepherd

Patrick Shepherd is a composer, teacher, conductor, adjudicator, reviewer and examiner. His compositions have been performed in New Zealand, UK, USA, South Korea, Germany, China, Russia and Australia. Patrick is also an Honorary Antarctic Arts Fellow, having travelled to Antarctica in 2004, and his Antarctic-inspired orchestral work, Cryosphere, was a finalist in the 2006 Lilburn Prize. Patrick holds degrees from the universities of Canterbury (DMus), London (MMus) and Manchester (BMus (Hons)), a Fellowship and Licentiate in Composition from Trinity College, London, and in 2007 he was the recipient of the Composers' Association of New Zealand (CANZ) Trust Fund Award for excellence and potential in composition.

Stuart Wise

Stuart was born in Hamilton, New Zealand. He studied music at the University of Otago and pursued a teaching career in Auckland, Nelson, the UK and Christchurch, before joining the (now the College of Education at the University of Canterbury) in 1997. Stuart was appointed as Head of Centre for the National Academy of Singing and Dramatic Art (NASDA) in 2000, for which he facilitated the move from Christchurch city to the Ilam campus of the Christchurch College of Education in 2001. In 2003 he decided to return to teacher education and currently teaches in music education courses and professional studies in the GradDipTchLn. At present he is programme coordinator for Grad Dip TchLn (Secondary). Recently completing a PhD, on the impact of ICT on music education in secondary schools, he is particularly interested in the perceptions of teachers and pupils, how these may differ from each other, and what implications these differences may have for teacher education in secondary music.
The refereeing procedure

Each article was read and assessed by two referees. This was a “blind” process in which the authors' names were removed from the articles before sending. Realistically, however, we acknowledge that in a field such as ours, it is impossible to keep authorship entirely anonymous, topics, specialities, references and collegial connections often providing compelling clues as to the author. All referees carried out their tasks with integrity, and we are most grateful for the time and consideration that they gave. The papers were sent to the referees without comment, and they were given no fixed format for replies, but were asked to consider –

- Research design
- Writing style and clarity
- Relevance of cited literature
- Impact of the research

and to consider an appropriate category from the following -

- Approve for publication in its present form
- Approve for publication, but recommend that the following changes are made
- Recommend that it be resubmitted with the following changes made to the satisfaction of the assessment panel
- Reject

Attempts are made to match, as far as practicable, referees with similar and related research interests to those articles that they are asked to assess. Members of the referee panel for the e-journal are –

Diana Blom
Diana Blom teaches music at the University of Western Sydney. Current research areas include the arts practice as research, music therapy and classroom outcomes, collaboration and tertiary popular songwriters.

Beth Bolton
Dr. Beth Bolton is Associate Professor of Music Education at Boyer College of Music and Dance, Temple University, Philadelphia. She is internationally renowned for her work on early childhood music development, and music learning theory.

Roger Buckton
Roger Buckton's career encompasses secondary school teaching, the music advisory service, teacher training and tertiary music education. His research interests currently focus on the music of immigrant communities and the degree of change that a transplanted culture experiences in comparison with those who “stayed home”.

Pamela Burnard
Senior Lecturer in the Faculty of Education at the University of Cambridge, UK where she manages Higher Degree course in Arts, Culture and Education and Educational Research.
Gordon Cox
Gordon Cox was senior lecturer in music education at the University of Reading until his retirement in 2007. He was co-editor of the *British Journal of Music Education*, and is the author or editor of four books about music education history.

Kay Hartwig
Dr Kay Hartwig is a senior lecturer in music/music education at Griffith University, Brisbane, Australia, and has taught music from pre school through to the tertiary sector. Kay's main research interests focus on sustainable vocal health for music teachers and quality music programs and their access for all students.

Samuel Leong
Associate Dean (Quality Assurance) of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences and Professor and Head of the Department of Cultural and Creative Arts at the Hong Kong Institute of Education. His current research projects are in the areas of interdisciplinary arts education, i-learning, performance wellness, assessment and curriculum reform.

Errol Moore
Dr. Errol Moore is Senior Lecturer in Music Education at the College of Education, University of Otago. His research interests are in the musical education of gifted and talented children, and in aspects of music and music education in the community.

David Sell
Adjunct Associate Professor in the School of Music, University of Canterbury, David Sell’s research interests focus on the history of music education in New Zealand, with particular interest in the influence of immigrant music education leaders in the nineteenth century.

Patrick Shepherd
An active composer, conductor, teacher and researcher, Dr. Patrick Shepherd lectures at the College of Education, University of Canterbury. His current research interests are on the incidence and music education implications of synaesthesia.

Jane Southcott
Associate Professor in the Faculty of Education at Monash University, Dr. Jane Southcott engages in a keen phenomenological exploration of community music, ageing and engagement in the arts, together with historical and biographical studies of the development of music curricula in Australia, America and Europe.

Trevor Thwaites
Dr. Trevor Thwaites is Principal Lecturer in Music Education, at the University of Auckland. His research interests include the philosophy and politics of music education; embodied learning, collaborative and informal learning; the Arts and experience, and critical perspectives on music technologies.

Stuart Wise
Dr. Stuart Wise is on the staff of the College of Education, University of Canterbury, and pursues his research interests on the impact of ICT in schools, and the relationships of teachers and students in the secondary school music environment.
**Editorial**

Whenever I talk over a research topic with new music education post-graduate students, it is almost certain that most will want as a premise that their topic should be practical and relevant to the classroom, or whatever music education situation they may headed for in the future. And why not? Music educators as a group seem to look for relevance and the chance to make a difference to the quality of lives of their pupils, and the betterment of society through that activity which we all love – music. Occasionally, we find someone with an interest in the past, but always with a view of the past being a precursor of current practices.

This issue, entitled ‘Window with a View”, borrows a phrase from Robyn Trinick’s article on the childrens’ orchestral instrumental scheme called “Sistema Aotearoa”. Robyn in turn quotes from Emily Styles’ notion of ‘window and mirror learning’. Robyn writes: “the idea of looking in and through mirrors and windows invokes notions of images, reflections, outlooks, perspectives and views”.

Each of the papers in this issue opens a window to a new perspective in the world of music education. Robyn takes us to the world of learning instruments as practised at Sistema Aotearoa. Here, the issues are related to introducing Maori and Pacific Island children to the world of European orchestral music. On the other hand, Dawn Joseph opens a different multicultural window viewing the introduction of indigenous African music to students of European traditions. In our multicultural world, these are key issues to be addressed and shared in music education circles: careful and reflective thought as exhibited by these authors is welcome.

We also live in a technological world and whilst music is one of the most traditional areas of the curriculum, arguably, it can be at the forefront of technology in schools. It is, therefore, appropriate for David Sell to remind us of how this began with the humble radio receiver. Still, as in considering some new piece of music education software, it is the same curriculum issues which emerge, such as the role of the teacher when the teaching is taken over by a ‘machine’. Whilst Froebel’s gifts seem to be beyond technological education – there were no power sockets in those days – nevertheless the type of ‘gifts’ offered by Froebel are based on the same type of analytical thinking that should be used in computer programming design and bearing in mind Jane Southcott’s opening sentence: “The importance of a sound theoretical basis for early childhood educational practice is undeniable.”

Rowena Riek’s article brings us back to the realities of current educational practices in schools where music as one of the arts is fighting for its place in an ever-crowded curriculum.

In fact all our authors exhibit the same characteristics as my post-graduate students. Each opens a window to an aspect of our music world and draws conclusions practically relevant in today’s schools. Many thanks to the authors for their contributions. It has been a pleasure to work with them.

I would also like to thank my associate editor, Patrick Shepherd, for his work in the editing phase, as well as David Sell for his work in layout and setting this edition for the internet.

Roger Buckton
Window with a View: Reflections on Sistema Aotearoa

Robyn Trinick
University of Auckland

Abstract

Sistema Aotearoa (SA) is an orchestral programme offered to children in Otara, Auckland, by the Auckland Philharmonia Orchestra (APO). The programme is voluntary, group-based, inclusive, and free of charge to participants and their whānau (families) and aims to give children from a low socio-economic area of Auckland opportunities to learn to play orchestral instruments.

Now in its fourth year of operation, SA is drawing increasing attention, not just from music educators, but also from general public who are intrigued by the idea of children in Otara playing orchestral music. Alongside the affirmations is an underlying critique of the socio-cultural implications of the programme, with suggestions that ‘elitist western classical music’ is being ‘imposed’ upon the children. The paper is framed around the notion of ‘window and mirror learning’, a metaphor used by Emily Style (1996) in her work relating to the need for curriculum to reflect and reveal a child’s sense of self in a multicultural world.

Keywords: Instrumental and orchestral teaching for children, El Sistema, window and mirror learning, multicultural music education.

The author

Robyn Trinick was a generalist primary teacher prior to becoming a lecturer in Primary and Early Childhood Music Education at the University of Auckland, a position she has held for over twenty years. Apart from her research on Sistema Aotearoa, her other interests include Māori music, music’s connection with language, and accessibility of music opportunities for all children, particularly in the fields of early childhood and junior primary.

Contact: robyn.trinick@auckland.ac.nz
Creating a Space and Place for Culture Bearers Within Tertiary Institutions: Experiencing East African Dance Songs in South Africa

Dawn Joseph
Deakin University, Melbourne

Abstract

This paper highlights the intersections between formal and informal African music and dance within a tertiary setting. Reflective practice, journaling and survey data within case study methodology provide a snapshot of the teaching and learning that took place at North West University in South Africa in October 2012. I argue for the inclusion of informal pedagogy of indigenous musics within the formal context of university courses. The experience provided a pathway to connect local community and university to celebrate the rich diversity of African music and culture. The teaching and learning experiences served as onsite professional development for tertiary students, music staff and myself.

Keywords: African music, Ugandan dance songs, culture, informal pedagogies, tertiary education

The author

Dawn Joseph is a senior lecturer in music and education studies at the Faculty of Arts and Education, Deakin University (Melbourne, Australia). Her publications and reviews are in the areas of teacher education, music education, African music, arts education, ageing and wellbeing, multiculturalism, culture and identity, and can be found in national and international journals. Dawn is a national committee member of the Australian Society for Music Education (ASME) and is Chair of the Victorian Chapter.

Contact: dawn.joseph@deakin.edu.au
Abstract

After decades of discovery and experimentation, the first public radio broadcast in New Zealand was in 1925, just five years after the USA, and one year after Great Britain. It took only two further years for the education and broadcasting authorities in New Zealand to recognise the potential of radio to reach the schools of its small, scattered population. From the beginning, music was the most consistently successful subject in New Zealand educational broadcasts. In this article the origins and influence on education and the community of broadcasts to schools in New Zealand are described and critically assessed. The reasons given by one leading music educator in 1937 for opposing schools broadcasts are examined in the light of music educational attitudes and practices seventy years later; and the influences in school music of the Broadcasts to Schools Songbooks in the latter half of the twentieth century and beyond are considered.

Keywords: Music education; radio broadcasts; history; community music; New Zealand.

The author

David Sell is Adjunct Associate Professor at the University of Canterbury School of Music, having previously worked as a secondary school music specialist, schools music adviser, associate professor and Head of the School of Music at the University of Canterbury. He serves on many arts and musical organisations, including Music Education Canterbury, Specialist Music Programme, and Arts Canterbury Inc., of which he is Chairman. He is currently Deputy President of the Australian and New Zealand Association for Research in Music Education (ANZARME). The author, co-author or editor of thirty-nine books, mostly concerning music education, David is also a concert reviewer for The Press, Christchurch.

Contact: david.sell@canterbury.ac.nz
Froebel’s Gifts to Early Childhood Music Education

Jane Southcott
Monash University, Melbourne

Abstract

The importance of a sound theoretical basis for early childhood educational practice is undeniable. This article discusses the application of Froebel’s approaches and materials to early childhood music education by two nineteenth century music educators steeped in the tonic solfa method of class music instruction, Daniel Batchellor of Philadelphia and Samuel McBurney of Victoria, Australia. Both were experienced, committed class music teachers who combined kindergarten and tonic sol-fa approaches to create engaging, developmentally sound programs for teaching music to young children. Both educators utilised Froebel's First and Eighth Gifts, the colour theories of earlier philosophers and bird images in their methods. Both educators worked independently but devised remarkably similar approaches. At a time when most kindergarten music was thematically related by text to learning activities, Batchellor and McBurney devised programs in which children could play and discover in music, thus applying Froebel’s practices to early childhood music education. Recently there has been renewed interest in the ideas and materials of Friedrich Froebel. This description of the efficacious blending of ideas suggests both a past model and current strategy for contemporary educators.

Key words: Early childhood music education, Froebel, tonic solfa, music education history

The author

Jane Southcott is an Associate Professor in the Faculty of Education, Monash University, Australia is a music education historian and hermeneutic phenomenologist. Jane is currently the President of the Australian and New Zealand Association for Research in Music Education and is a member of the editorial boards of international and national refereed journals. She teaches in postgraduate programs and supervises many postgraduate doctoral research students.

Contact: Jane Southcott@monash.edu
The Parental Voice in Primary School Education Policy: Do the Arts have a Place?

Rowena Riek
Griffith University, Brisbane

Abstract

Since 2007, there has been added tension within the Australian schooling system from what can be called a performative culture resulting from the influences of neoliberalism and globalisation. This culture of performativity is characterised and driven by standardisation and accountability in curriculum, pedagogy and assessment. In Australia, as in many nations, this practice has been established through the introduction of national testing, a prescriptive national curriculum, and a focus on that which can be measured. This culture influences parental understandings and expectations of schooling in terms of what is valued, and in turn has wider implication for arts education. As part of a wider doctoral study, this paper uses the findings from parent data collected through a school-wide survey and semi-structured interviews to determine to what extent music and arts education are valued in a climate of accountability. The findings also provide an understanding of the nature of schooling in terms of how parents see the role of the school in delivering a diverse, rich and engaging curriculum.

Keywords: Primary school curriculum. Australia, music and arts education, parental perceptions

The author

Rowena Riek is a performing arts teacher with experience in primary, secondary, tertiary and special education. As an employee of Education Queensland, she has been involved in the development and implementation of music and dance curricula in Qld schools, the direction and production of musical theatre performances, and instrumental and vocal performances in both schools and community contexts. Rowena also works as a part-time tutor at Griffith University where she has recently been awarded her PhD. Her thesis examined the effects of a performative culture in schools on arts education.

Contact: r.riek@griffith.edu.au
# Index of Sound Ideas 1997 to 2009

**Volume 1**  
No. 1  July 1997  *Music and the Arts: an arranged marriage*  
No. 2  November 1997  *The business of music education*  
No. 3  April 1998  *Assessment in music education*

**Volume 2**  
No. 1  July 1998  *Tangata whenua and tangata Pasifika: music of the people*  
No. 2  November 1998  *Music and Learning*  
No. 3  March/April 1999  "Switched on" Technology in music education

**Volume 3**  
No. 1  July/August 1999  *Music in early childhood*  
No. 2  December 1999  *Research in Music Education*  
No. 3  April 2000  *Nurturing through music*

**Volume 4**  
No. 1  August 2000  *Asians and Western European music*  
No. 2  January 2001  *The Church and Music Education*  
No. 3  May/June 2001  *Practice and performance: worldly practices*

**Volume 5**  
No. 1  September 2001  *Where's the next gig? New challenges for music education*  
No. 2  April 2002  *Are you qualified to teach music?*  
No. 3  June 2002  *Blowing your own: makers and shakers*

**Volume 6**  
No. 1  March 2003  *Voices from the past*  
No. 2  May 2003  *Musical preferences - musical journeys through life*  
No. 3  August 2004  *Folk music in a multicultural society*

**Volume 7**  
June 2007  *Teaching to listen*

**Volume 8**  
No. 1  March 2009  *Music Education E-Live*

## Index of e-Journal of studies in music education 2010 - 2014

**Volume 8**  
No. 2  January 2010  *Music education in the wider community*

**Volume 9**  
No. 1  November 2010  *Metacognition et al*  
No. 2  February 2013  *Access and standards*

**Volume 10**  
No. 1  July 2014  *Window with a view: music education perspectives from Africa, Australia and New Zealand*